Contents

Foreword i

Preface iv

About the authors vii

Contents ix

Overview 1

Need for and purposes of this handbook 1

Making available knowledge of options for the processes of constitution-making and reform 1

The intended audience for the handbook 4

The handbook as a tool in ongoing dialogue with constitution-makers 4

How to use this handbook 5

Acknowledgments 9

Some emerging guiding principles 9

Public participation 9

Inclusiveness (including gender equity) and representation 10

Transparency 10

National ownership 10

Impacts of adherence to guiding principles 10

Part 1: Introduction to constitution-making processes 13

1.1 The role of a constitution 13

1.1.1 Increase in constitutions 13

1.1.2 Importance of, but difficulty in implementing, constitutions 13

1.1.3 Constitutions as symbols and manifestos, and as legal rules 14

1.1.4 Constitutions as contracts among people or peoples 15

1.1.5 Orientation of new constitutions 15

1.1.6 Choices for constitution-makers 16
1.1.7 Constitutionalizing responsibilities and duties 16

1.2 Issues of process 17
1.2.1 Changing ideas and practices of constitution-making 17
1.2.2 Can the constitution-making process be designed? 18

1.3 Key components and issues of the constitution-making process 19
1.3.1 The importance of a design 19

1.4 Tasks and responsibilities in constitution-making 20
1.4.1 Resources 21
1.4.2 Sequencing the process 21
1.4.3 Deadlines 23
1.4.4 Agreeing on an agenda for constitutional reform 24
1.4.5 The form of the agreement 24
1.4.6 Scope of reform: Interim, minimal, or complete? 25
1.4.7 Actors and public participation 25
1.4.8 Deadlock-breaking mechanisms 27
1.4.9 Drafting the constitution 28
1.4.10 Debating the draft constitution 29
1.4.11 Enacting the constitution 29
1.4.12 Implementing the constitution 30

1.5 Assessing the impact of the constitution-making process 31

1.6 Who does what? A table 31

Part 2: Tasks in a constitution-making process 34
Types of tasks 34
Organization of this part 35

2.1 Tasks—starting a process 35
2.1.1 The constitutional starting point 35
2.1.2 Deciding if a process is needed 36
More modest enterprises 37
The constitutional moment? 38

2.1.3 Starting a process: The law and the politics 38
When there is no constitution 38
When there is an existing constitution 39
Some examples of initiation 40
The political dimensions of starting a process 40
2.1.4 Design 42
Who designs? 43
Sequencing 44
2.1.5 Timetables 46
Who should set the timetable? 47
Rigid or flexible? 48
Factors likely to result in completion on time 48
What happens if a deadline simply expires? 49
How can a timetable be enforced? 49
Some examples of timetables 49
2.1.6 Legal basis for the design 50
What to do if it is hard, or impossible, to follow the existing procedures . . .53
2.1.7 Preparing the constitution-makers 55
The objectives 56
Developing a program for substantive constitutional issues 56
Approaches to learning 58
Resources 60
2.1.8 Guiding principles for the process 60
Agreeing on guiding principles: An increasingly important task 60
The nature of guiding principles 61
Principles in documents that establish constitution-making processes 61
Guiding principles: A common phenomenon 62
Sources of principles for constitution-making processes 62
Who decides on the guiding principles? 62
Verifiable principles in conflict situations involving entrenched minorities . . . 63
Other cases of verifiable principles 64
How are principles used? 65
Must guiding principles be followed? 65
Comments 66

2.1.9 Interim constitutional arrangements 67
Interim and incremental: Connected but different 67
Reasons for interim arrangements 67
The negative side of interim arrangements 69
Interim arrangements as road maps to a new constitution 70
The orientation and scope of the interim arrangements 71
Who negotiates the interim arrangements 71
Forms of interim arrangements 72
Legality of interim arrangements 73
Managing the transition period 73
Internally managed interim arrangements 75
2.1.10 Starting over when a process has "failed" 75
Back to square one 76
Giving up 76
What about the "no constitution" countries? 76
Gradual change 77
Starting from where you left off 77
The "political will" question 78
On not rushing to change the new document 78

2.2 Public participation 80
2.2.1 Introduction to public participation issues 80
Changing modes of making the constitution 80
Meanings and aspects of public participation 81
The impact of public participation 83
The relevance of decision-making bodies 83
Participants 84
Assessing the impact of public participation 85
Potential opportunities in public participation 86
Potential risks of public participation 87
Conclusion 90
2.2.2 Preparing the public to participate: Civic education 91
Key stages of civic education 92
Who conducts civic education programs? 95
Planning civic education 96

Practical planning tips 96
Methods of civic education 97
Television and radio 97
Print materials 98
Cultural and sporting events, games, and competitions 99
Official website of the constitution-making body 99
Mobile messaging services and social media 101
Civic education workshops 101
Practical tips for conducting civic education programs 103
Some challenges of implementing civic education programs 105
2.2.3 Public consultation 108
Public consultation on both the constitution-making process and the contents of the constitution 109
Public consultation on issues about the constitution-making process . . . 109
Public consultation on issues about the contents of the constitution 111
Legally mandated public consultation, and public views as one source among others 112
Which body conducts public consultation 116
Reasons for, and claims about the impacts of, public consultation 117
Some guiding principles for conducting a public consultation process 120
Planning well in advance of the public consultation 121
Establishing realistic timetables 122
Preparing the public to participate meaningfully 122
Being transparent 122
Being representative 122
Ensuring that the consultative process is accessible, secure and inclusive 122
Respectfully listening to the public's views 123
Faithfully recording, collating, analyzing, and considering the views submitted 124
Carefully considering the public's views when making key decisions . . . 124
Being accountable and providing feedback 124
Ensuring that the consultative process is nationally owned and led 124
Evaluating the consultative process 125

Choosing methods for consulting the public 125
Requests for submissions of people's views 126
Using the Internet, phone lines, texting, and social media to call for and receive views 126
Use of guiding questions 127
Practical tips for guiding questions 128
Use of questionnaire-based surveys 128
Conducting a scientific questionnaire-based survey 128
Volunteer questionnaires 130
Reports on surveys 130
Practical tips on surveys 131
Use of face-to-face public consultation meetings 131
Public consultation meetings 132
Focus groups 134
Meetings with sectoral groups 135
Thematic meetings 136
Practical tips for organizing all types of face-to-face meetings 136
Using video to facilitate public consultation 137
2.2.4 Receiving and analyzing the people's views 139
Experiences of processes in which the people's views have been received . 139
Effects of public consultation choices for receiving and analyzing the people's views 142
Requirements for receiving and processing views 143
Who collects and analyzes the views 143
The various forms in which views may be provided, and receiving and storing the views 144
Analysis of the views 146
Staff, resources, and funds 147
Reports of constitution-making bodies on use of the people's views 148

2.3 Administering and managing the process and its resources 149
2.3.1 The core tasks of administering and managing a process 149
2.3.2 Strategic and operational planning 150
2.3.3 Financial management 154
Budgeting and costing for the process 155

Practical tips 156
Financial accountability 157
2.3.4 Personnel 158
Hiring or seconding personnel 158
Employees, seconded personnel, and consultants 160
Accountability of personnel 160
2.3.5 Capacity development 161
2.3.6 Foreign advisors 162
Avoiding common pitfalls of using foreign advisors 163
2.3.7 Making a historical record of the process 165
2.3.8 Keeping records 165
Why record keeping? 165
Issues in record keeping 166
More on records and record keeping 167
2.3.9 Translation and interpretation services 168
Translation for nationals 168
Translation for foreigners—and of foreign material for nationals 169
Practical tips 170
2.3.10 Security 171
2.3.11 The media 173
The media strategy 173
Developing rules regarding media access 174
2.3.12 "Managing" relationships with the international community 175
Who is the "international community" in a constitution-making process? . . 175
The interests and roles of the international community 176
Donor funding to the process 177
2.3.13 Making the rules of procedure and decision-making—when and who? . 180
Who makes the rules? 180
Sources for rules 181
What are rules for? 182
2.3.14 Dealing with problems in the process 183
Why processes come to a halt 183
How processes come to a halt 183
When processes come to a halt 184

2.4 The agenda of constitutional issues and generating ideas on the issues 186
2.4.1 Determining the agenda of constitutional issues 186
The importance of the agenda 186
What are constitutional issues? 186
Deciding the agenda in advance of the constitution-making process 187
Setting the agenda in the course of the process 188
Focusing on the divisive issues 189
2.4.2 Generating ideas on the constitutional issues 189
Analyzing the defects in the existing constitution 189
What may be wrong with the previous constitution? 190
Some cautions 191
Sources of ideas 191

2.5 Debating and deciding the issues 194
2.5.1 Procedures and rules for debating and deciding 194
Major issues 194
Quorum 194
Speaking rules 195
Notice rules 196
Politeness and decorum rules 196
Decision-making and voting 196
Caucuses 200
Openness 200
Relations with the public and the media 201
Rules for a commission or similar body 201
2.5.2 Dealing with divisive issues 202
What is a divisive issue? 202

2.6 The constitutional text: Coherence and drafting 208
2.6.1 Ensuring coherence in the constitutional provisions 208
Incoherence 208
Avoiding incoherence 209
2.6.2 Drafting the constitutional text 210
The courts' approach 211

Drafting styles 211
Stages of text development 212
The work of the technical drafter 213
Drafting the constitutional text 214
Issues in drafting 215
Language 215
"Plain English"—or other languages 215
Inclusiveness and approachability 215
Length 215
Constitutional structure 216
Risks and dangers 216
Some issues for the drafters themselves 216

2.7 Adopting and implementing the constitution 217
2.7.1 Adoption, ratification, and promulgation 217
Adoption 218
Ratification 219
Endorsement 219
Assent 220
Promulgation 220
Coming into effect 220
2.7.2 Implementation 222
Implementing, promoting, and safeguarding the constitution 222
Implementation 222
Promotion 223
Safeguarding 223
Can a constitution-making process contribute to implementation? 223
Design of the process—encouraging public awareness during and after . . . 224
Content and language of the constitution—speaking to the people 224
Constitutional mechanisms for encouraging implementation and promotion 225
Constitutional devices to safeguard (and implement) a constitution 226
Internal devices to encourage safeguarding and implementation 226
Protection of the constitution from coups 226
Protection from hasty or damaging amendments 226
Limits on emergency powers 227

Certification of the constitutionality of legislative bills 227
Judiciary 227
Independent bodies for accountability and redress, and politically sensitive roles 227
Codes of conduct 227
Direct democracy 228
External devices to encourage safeguarding (and implementation) 228

Part 3: Institutions, groups, and procedures 229
How the bits may fit together 231
Different patterns 232

3.1 Institutions with multiple roles 232
3.1.1 Introduction 232
3.1.2 Constitutional assemblies 232
Legislatures and assemblies: The relationship 233
Arguments for and against separating the legislature and the constitutional assembly 235
Legal status of assemblies 236
Design 237
Size 239
Membership 239
Election and selection of members 240
Campaign 243
Federations or federating countries 244
Qualifications of members 244
Experts as members? 245
Nonmembers with special relationships 245
Payment of members 245
Structure of the assembly 246
Committees 246
Place 247
Support and facilities 248
Duration 248
What happens to an assembly once it has finished its task? 248

Conclusion 249
3.1.3 National conferences 249
Origins of national conferences 249
French and other influences 250
Some features and problems of national conferences 251
Processes for establishing national conferences 251
Roles and tasks 252
Size, composition, and duration 253
Issues arising from large size, complex composition, and short duration 254
Chairing, and looking forward 255
Constitutional outcomes of national conferences 255
Practical tips 256

3.2 Institutions that develop proposals about which final decisions are made elsewhere 256
3.2.1 Parties to peace processes 257
3.2.2 The roundtable 261
Practical tips 264
3.2.3 Constitutional commissions, committees, and other specialist bodies . . 264
Whether to have a commission 265
General rationale for independent commissions 265
Some weaknesses 266
Explaining the use of commissions 267
Designing an effective commission 268
Membership 268
Legal framework 269
Separate commission or committee of the legislature or assembly? 270
What happens to the commission draft? 271
Other, specialist, bodies 273
Conclusions 273

3.3 Administrative management bodies 274
Establishing the administrative management body 274
Role and powers 275
Directing the administrative management body 276

Creating specialized units or departments 278
The need for an organizational chart 280
Practical tips 280

3.4 Specialist or technical input institutions 281
3.4.1 Experts 281
History 281
Changing roles of experts 281
Functions of experts 283
Local versus foreign experts 284
Practical tips 284
3.4.2 Electoral management bodies 285
Election issues 285
Referendum issues 286
3.4.3 Government departments and agencies 287
Governmental authorities and the roles they play 287
Authorities established mainly to provide support for the constitution-making process 289
Preexisting authorities that are given additional roles providing support for the process 290
External authorities that can influence or participate directly in the process 291
Relations between constitution-making bodies and other authorities 291
3.4.4 Courts 292
Courts with integral roles in constitution-making 293
Courts with the possibility of blocking change 293
Courts and referendums 294
Special roles in implementation 294
Problems 294
Special courts 295
Practical tips 295

3.5 Referendums and plebiscites 296
3.5.1 Approving and ratifying the constitution 296
Uses of referendum 297

Prevalence of referendum 298
Status of referendum 298
Rules regarding voting 298
Debating referendums 299
Arguments in favor of referendum 299
People's sovereignty and democracy; conformity with international norms—self-determination 299
People's participation 299
Check on constitution-makers 300
Accountability of constitution-makers 300
Incentives for compromise to ensure general support of all ethnic and other communities 300
Change after careful consideration 300
People's knowledge of constitutional matters 300
Nation-building 301
Legitimacy—people's aspirations: Putting the matter beyond doubt 301
Arguments against referendum 301
A constitution is not a one-issue matter, but a complex set of values and institutions 301
Danger of misleading campaigns 301
Voting for the wrong reasons 302
Dangers of manipulation and intimidation, and seeking spurious legitimacy 302
Deeply divisive or polarizing effect of referendum in multiethnic states . . 302
A better form of public participation is at earlier stages of the process: People as decision-makers 302
Referendum can be used to defeat the results of a fair and participatory process 303
In multiethnic states, the better solution is to negotiate in good faith . . 303
Legitimacy comes from the fairness and effectiveness of the constitution 303
Importance of the question 303
Comment on the debate 304
Referendum reforms 304

Part 4: Guide to key external actors in the process: Civil society, the media, and the international community 306

4.1 Civil society and the media 306
4.1.1 Promoting or organizing for constitutional change or reforms 307
4.1.2 Informing and educating the people about electoral issues related to constitution-making 308
4.1.3 Civic education 309
4.1.4 Public consultation 310
4.1.5 Submissions to the constitution-making body 310
Unsolicited submissions 312
Sensitive issues 313
Timing 314
Staying interested 314
4.1.6 Research 314
4.1.7 Lobbying 314
4.1.8 Monitoring a process 315
Establishing a relationship with the official process 316
Keeping the pressure up 316
The balance between encouragement and critique 317
An effective monitoring program 317

4.2 Guidance for the international community 321
4.2.1 Common pitfalls of processes led or heavily influenced by the international community 322
Lack of doctrinal or practical guidance for constitutional assistance 322
The imposition of tight timetables 323
Public participation that is not viewed as credible 324
Engaging only political elites or warring factions 325
Treating constitution-making as primarily a technical exercise 325
Stressing electoral solutions to problems of representation and legitimacy . 326
Failure to develop capacity of national actors and promote national ownership 327
Assistance or engagement ends with adoption of a constitution 327
4.2.2 Current guidance for the international community 327
Practical tips 328

Appendix A: Case studies 330
A.1 Afghanistan [2004] 330

A.2 Benin [1990] 332
A.3 Bolivia [2009] 334
A.4 Bosnia-Herzegovina [1995] 335
A.5 India [1950] 336
A.6 Iraq [2005] 338
A.7 Kenya [2005; 2010] 340
A.8 Nepal [ongoing process] 341
A.9 Papua New Guinea [1975; 1995] 342
A.10 Poland [1997] 345
A.11 Timor-Leste [2002] 347
A.12 Uganda [1995] 348

Appendix B: Glossary 350

Appendix C: Sample codes of conduct 362
C.1 Sample code of conduct for a member of a constitution-making body . . . 362
C.2 Sample code of conduct for civic education providers 363
C.3 Sample of code of conduct for members of a constitution-making body consulting with the public 365

Appendix D: References 367

Boxes

Box 1. Colombia's popular movement for reform 41
Box 2. The Kenyan process [2010] and the Bougainville process [2004] 45
Box 3. Damaging deadlines 46
Box 4. "Revolutionary legality" and "necessity" 52
Box 5. South Africa: The certification judgments 63
Box 6. Negotiating interim arrangements in Nepal 70
Box 7. "Incremental" change in Chile 74
Box 8. Options for "starting over" in Kenya 77
Box 9. Who should participate—and how? (Sometimes known as "actor mapping") 78
Box 10. Veil of ignorance 88
Box 11. Civic education in Rwanda prior to the referendum [2003] 92
Box 12. South Africa [1996]: Preparing the public to participate 93
Box 13. Examples of official websites of constitution-making bodies 99
Box 14. Evaluations of civic education workshops: Some observations 107
Box 15. Examples of legal mandates to conduct public consultations 114
Box 16. Uganda: The use of views 115
Box 17. Nepal 2009: Problems that arise when a process is poorly planned . . . 121
Box 18. Use of the Internet in Kosovo [2008] 127
Box 19. Pitfalls to avoid when using volunteer questionnaires: The case of Iraq [2005] 130
Box 20. How South Africa's two million submissions were counted 140
Box 21. Use of views in Papua New Guinea [1975] 141
Box 22. Use of social media to prepare a constitution: The case of Iceland . . . . . [ongoing process] 145
Box 23. Example of a strategic planning process 152
Box 24. Benefits of a diverse staff 157
Box 25. Examples of secondments: Timor-Leste [2002] 159
Box 26. Translating the language of constitutions 169
Box 27. Establishment of a donor group: Afghanistan [2004] 179
Box 28. Who makes the rules? 182
Box 29. What is a simple majority? A debate in the Timor-Leste constituent . . . . . assembly [2002] 197

Box 30. Challenges to participation of women in decision-making bodies 198
Box 31. Parliament as the source of incoherence in the Fiji constitution 209
Box 32. Development of the text in some modern constitutions 213
Box 33. Bringing the constitution into effect in Eritrea [1997]: A mistake 218
Box 34. Adopting, promulgating, and publishing the Kenyan constitution [2010] . . 221
Box 35. Commissions or committees? 230
Box 36. The nondeliberative constitution-making role of parliament 235
Box 37. South Africa: One body, two roles 235
Box 38. Members' active participation 242
Box 39. Questions to think about when establishing a commission or committee . 271
Box 40. Nepal [ongoing process]: A poorly planned management structure . . . 276
Box 41. An election for a constituent assembly 286
Box 42. Oranges and bananas: Kenya [2005] 287
Box 43. Ministers of constitutional affairs 288
Box 44. Use of South Africa's petitions [1996] 312
Box 45. Abolition of the death penalty in South Africa 315
Box 46. Civil society monitoring in Zimbabwe 319

Tables

Table 1. Countries/regions discussed in this handbook 7
Table 2. Who does what? 33
Table 3. Constitutional review timetable 39
Table 4. Constitutional review initiation 40
Table 5. Stages of a constitution-making process where public consultation took place on the content of the constitution 113
Table 6. Types of positions staffed in a constitution-making process 158
Table 7. Comparison of a constitutional assembly and a parliament 231
Table 8. Functions of constitutional assemblies 238
Table 9. Composition of constitutional assemblies 241
Table 10. National conferences in French-speaking African countries, 1990–1993 252